



Feminist Research

Homepage: www.gathacognition.com/journal/gcj2

<http://dx.doi.org/10.21523/gcj2>



Original Research Paper

Patriarchal Features in Post-Independence Indian English Novels



Kalpana Nehere*

Gatha Cognition

Abstract

Feminist analyses of novels can give insights about women's life in contemporary society. Fifteen Indian novels written after independence by women and men novelists have been reviewed to understand the role of patriarchy with feminist approach. These novels depict patriarchy as symbolic power, property rights, essence of father, husband and child, urge for son, women's activities for the sake of husband, etc. Hierarchical stratified caste based Indian social structure supports patriarchy as notion. Characters, setting or situations, dialogues, point of view, etc. in these selected novels show unequal, secondary and exploited status of women in Indian society. Women blindly follow patriarchal rules and traditional structure with rituals. Therefore, justice, liberty, equality and fraternity given in Constitution of India are yet to be achieved for women. Only few characters are rebellious for their constitutional rights and came out of home at workplaces but as 'hands of gold'. The findings and analysis of the study are useful to understand the status of women in Indian society for planning and management to achieve constitutional provisions for social welfare.

Article history

Received: 12 February 2019

Revised: 28 April 2019

Accepted: 25 May 2019

Key words

Novels;
Feminism;
Patriarchy;
Women;
Hands of Gold;
Child;
Son.

Processing Editor(s)

Fatima Sadiqi
Souad Slaoui

© 2018 GATHA COGNITION® All rights reserved.

1 INTRODUCTION

Women are half of the human population but they are under the burden of grief and tears. Idealism claims that the world is not cognisable (Sen, 1998; Prasad, 2011) and ignores the slaves, *shudra* as well as women for their not only the rights but minimum requirements. Patriotic religious thinkers believe in 'freedom' to be a difficult task under one sky and on one shared Earth (Matustik, 2002). Hawkesworth (2004) rightly pointed that the dwarfed approach of fascist philosopher which believes that 'God' assists 'Man' to protect from a dangerous feminist body. However, historical materialists believe in change is the result of actions taken by human within material world and it is not in the hands of God or some other spiritual forces (Deal and Beal, 2004). This materialist philosophy claims that we are element of the great world and the world is cognisable, therefore, inferior status of women in the society is cognisable.

Indian women are equal to men before law (Constitution of India, Article 14). Constitution of India prohibits discrimination on the ground of sex (Article 15); provides equal opportunity to women for employment (Article 16); protects rights regarding freedom of speech and expression, assembling, forming association, move freely, residing and settlement (Article 19); protects life and personal liberty of any person (Article 21).

Constitution of India directs to state (Article 39) to secure equality between men and women to have adequate means of livelihood (Article 39a); equal pay for equal work for both men and women (Article 39b); and ensure the health and strength of women (Article 39e). Article 42 gives directives to the state to make provision for securing humanly conditions for maternity relief and article 51-A (e) asks to renounce the dignity of women. Article 326 is ensuring the process of political empowerment of women in India.

* Author address for correspondence

Gatha Cognition, Shivajinagar, At/post/Tal: Akole - 422601, Dist.: Ahmednagar, Maharashtra, India.

Tel.: +912424-221179

E-mail: kpnehere@gmail.com (K. Nehere-Corresponding author)

<http://dx.doi.org/10.21523/gcj2.18020203>

'Feminist research is research by, about and for women but the research conducted by and about men may be feminist' (Cosgrove and McHugh, 2000; Hans, 2013). Feminist research includes women's lives, equalities, empowerment, socialization, improved status, etc. (Ghosh, 2007). This research is to give voice to women and find tools for their emancipation (Cosgrove and McHugh, 2000). Campbell and Wasco (2000) suggested both quantitative and qualitative methods for feminist research. Feminist researchers should focus on postmodernity to democratic transformations of experiences of girls and women (Weiner, 2004). Feminist researchers and activists have been attracted attention towards different kinds of violence: gender, sex, identity, domestic violence of love, everyday violence, etc. (Turksma, 2001). It is very complicated understanding about 'relationship' for violence and feminist actions (Zalewski and Runyan, 2013). However, feminist philosophy focused on historical exclusion and negative characterization of women (Witt, 2004a). This philosophy widely criticized for misogyny of great philosophers, gendered interpretations of theoretical concepts, synoptic interpretations (Witt, 2004b), connection with Western feministic theories (singular and bonsai), etc. However, Hemmings (2007) has tried to refigure sexuality as both pleasure and constraint. Indian feminist writers like Salman Rushdie, Vikram Seth, Shashi Tharoor (b. 1956), Upamanyu Chatterjee (b. 1959), Ruth Praver Jhabvala (1927-2013), Manju Kapur and Amitav Ghosh have been rejected Western feminist theories for values, ideologies, beliefs and norms of living (Dar, 2013).

Feminist studies are mainly focused on struggle for women's necessities like food, fuel, water, etc., health and reproductive freedom, education, employment opportunities, equal pay and safe working environment, women's rights and personal, social and cultural problems. All these aspects are concerned with patriarchy based foundation of Indian society. The

representation of women in the novel is validated with the contemporary social situations created in the world of novel through the elements of novel such as characters, setting or situations, dialogues, point of view and so on as delineated and depicted as a mirror image of contemporary socio-cultural setup of the society. Feminist analyses of novels can give insights about women's life in contemporary social setup with their dynamics. India became independent on 15th August 1947 and resolved own Constitution of India for justice, liberty, equality and fraternity. This reform gives equal place to women and men. Therefore, fifteen novels (Table 1) written after independence by women and men novelists have been reviewed to understand the role of patriarchy in formation of women's status in Indian society. Feminist approach is the prime way of analyses in the present study.

2 PATRIARCHY

Novelists show patriarchy as symbolic power, property rights, essence of father, essence of husband, urge for son, women's activities for the sake of husband, etc. Recently, women came out of home at workplaces but as 'hands of gold', not as independent person. Men control women in all activities.

2.1 Symbolic Power

The patriarchy expresses through family structure as an individual man holds power through the institution of fatherhood. The 'symbolic power' accumulates with father as the essence of patriarchy in Indian culture. Religious literature tries to propagate the ideology of patriarchy through myths like Brahma, Adam and Eve, etc. The literature notices that the first individual is 'he' and 'she' comes later (CD: 97). It gives all kind of rights to men to deny women though Constitution of India secures equality between men and women (Constitution of India, Article 14, 15, 39). Patriarchy associates with ideological control over women's sexuality and labour

Table 1. Selected novels

Name of novel	Abbreviation	Novelist
Nectar in a Seive (1954)	NIS	Kamala Markandaya
Train to Pakistan (1956)	TTP	Khushwant Singh
Cry The Peacock (1963)	CTP	Anita Desai
The Foreigner (1968)	TF	Arun Joshi
The Tiger's Daughter (1971)	TTD	Bharati Mukherjee
Wife (1975)	W	Bharati Mukherjee
The Shadow Lines (1988)	TSL	Amitav Ghosh
That Long Silence (1989)	TLS	Shashi Deshpande
The God of Small Things (1998)	TGST	Arundhati Roy
Difficult Daughters' (1998)	DD	Manju Kapur
Moving On (2004)	MO	Shashi Deshpande
A Married Woman (2006)	MW	Munju Kapur
In the Country of Deceit (2008)	CD	Shashi Deshpande
The 3 Mistakes of My Life (2008)	TMML	Chetan Bhagat
Revolution 2020 (2011)	RT	Chetan Bhagat

at home and workplace (Foord and Gregson, 1986; Moghadam, 1992). Further, father plays the role of provider and head of the family and mother as caretaker and heart of the family (Zinn, 2000; Nehere, 2017).

Khushwant Singh presents patriarchal family head, hold, power and relations in 'Train to Pakistan'. The man, Lala Ram is the head of Hindu family carries all kind of powers and its hold. The women inform to the dacoits,

'I tell you Lalaji is not in. He has taken the keys with them. We have nothing in the house.' (TTP: 8)

RK is head of the family in Deshpande's MO not aware about his position but his wife Gayatri tries to maintain his headship. She arranges special chair, towel, etc. for RK which no one permitted and dare to share it.

The entire household revolved around RK – Gayatri arranged it that way – but he never seemed to be aware of it. (MO: 77)

'Here, wipe your hands'. But aware of Gayatri's eyes which warned us not to take the towel, we would say, 'It's okay, Kaka', and go out to wipe our hands on the 'janata towel', as BK called it. (MO: 77)

Similarly, Kamala also takes care of BK and his all comforts and giving his place as husband and father as head of the family.

I never saw BK doing any chore in the house; even his Scotch, soda and ice were placed before him by Kamala, ... (MO: 92)

Another woman, Vasu placed her husband, Badri Narayan at paramount place in the house. She believes that he is the *annadata*, the 'breadwinner' and respectable. She muttered at the end of each meal - '*Annadata sukhi bhava*', (MO: 122).

Children are prominently known by father's identity and not by mother's.

'Are you Badri Narayan's daughter?' (MO: 128)

Men follow the patriarchal customs which bound him to carry his headship, power and simultaneous responsibilities. Devayani's father, Vasant not ready to accept his wife's money for daughter's marriage as head of the family (CD: 63). Here it is notable that Constitution of India (Article 39a) gives equal rights to women and men to have means of livelihood.

Not only the society believes but prominent philosophers and literature support men that only men are able to keep things safe including women (Nehere, 2017). According to them men have masculine power and strengths more than women and children. Therefore,

women have not to say about their desires. Nooran in TTP unwillingly goes with her father instead of her love and desire to stay with Juggut Singh at Mano Majra. She has no courage to inform her father about her love. Constitution of India broken down this extra superficial provision for men in the society and protects the freedom of speech and expression for women (Article 19).

Nathan and Rukmani in NIS both earn money but she is not ready to spent money on Puli's wooden cart without permission of her husband. She says,

While I thought again and again of what I would say to my husband. (NIS: 186)

Culture also supports to have power with men and discourage women to own her essential. Markandaya's Rukmani says helplessly and confirm about hard work for her survival.

Ira and I did what we could; but the land is mistress of man, not to woman: the heavy work needed is beyond her strength. (NIS: 131)

Similar understanding about culture is also inculcated within men. Nathan worried about survival of family members in his illness (NIS: 132). Moreover, men are not only leading the family but also oppressive power in the society accumulates with men leaders. The priest, train driver, officers, etc. presented in TTP and NIS are men whereas, women are at secondary and inferior place. Iqbal Singh explained the complexities of relations in patriarchal Indian society.

'Term like *Sala*, wife's brother ('I would like to sleep with your sister'), and *susra*, farther-in-law ('I would like to sleep with your daughter') were as often term of affection for one's friends and relatives as expressions of anger to insult one's enemies. Conversation of any topic – politics, philosophy, sport- soon come down to sex, which everyone enjoyed with a lot of giggling and hand-slapping.' (TTP: 113)

Women are also carries the patriarchal principles willingly or unwillingly. It is very difficult to accept Nooran with her premarital pregnancy for Jugga's mother. Religious marriage and son are essentials in patriarchy. Therefore, Iqbal Singh expresses that,

.....claimed to possess remedies for barrenness and medicines to induced wombs to yield male children. (TTP: 113)

Men's names are suffixed by '*nath*' i.e. Kailashnath, Gopinath, Krishanath, Prakashnath and Hiranath. The suffix '*nath*' indicates the power of men. They are the owner of Kailash - means heaven and richness, Gopi - lovely women, sometimes Gopi called

to Krishna, but here it is nath of Krishna, Prakash - the light and Hira - the diamond. Women's names are suffixed by 'mati' and 'vati' i.e. Virmati, Indumati, Gunvati, Hemavati, Vidyavati, and Parvati. They indicate the intelligence of women (DD: 4).

In the male centric society, men always try to get credit of success to own even women contribute their efforts. Manjari in MO learnt to drive a car within two months but credit of learning goes to the instructor instead of Manjari's efforts (MO: 162). Kapur explores men's views about Astha's painting which got better price in exhibition. It is Astha's efforts but Hemant tells everyone that this is an example of his wife's work (MW: 159). In patriarchy base society, maternal relations are at secondary place. They have no courage and rights to interact with relations from in-laws of daughter. Astha's father feels shame for getting help and support from son-in-law, Hemant,

Hemant helped them to move. I don't like asking him to do so much for us, beti,' said the father.

'He is your son-in-law, Papa. It is all right,' said Astha. (MW: 53)

Kapur explores the essentiality of son in the patriarchal family as,

'Of course they don't matter to me. I was so pleased Anu was a girl. But that doesn't mean we should not try for a boy. I am the only son.' (MW: 61)

Don't worry, sweetheart, then we will try again, it's perfectly all right. (MW: 68)

Kapur, Deshpande and Bhagat present women's belief and support to male centric society in their novels. Deshpande shows the need of men's protection to women from early childhood (MO: 40). Conversation between Raja and Manjari gives idea about essence of men. Raja says,

'Whoever it is, you shouldn't talk to anyone alone.'

Manjari replies,

'No, I should loudly announce that I am a helpless female who can't take her own decisions.'

Raja says,

'Forget your feminism for a moment and face facts, Jiji. It helps to let people know you're not alone.'

Manjari replies,

'I did that. I spoke of my children, of my SON.....' (MO: 219)

Further, Bhagat also explores that women are in need of men for protection. Gopal says to Arati,

'Even a simple girl needs love, security, attention, support. Right?' (RT: 223)

Astha's mother and Hemant's mother both are orthodox. According to them, the family without son is incomplete as,

'The family is complete at last,' said Astha's mother piously, feeling her own contribution. (MW: 68)

Hemant's mother agreed, too happy in the birth of her grandson, carrier of the line, the seed, the name, to respond with her usual reserve to someone she increasingly felt was her social inferior. (MW: 68)

Kapur shows the difference between American and Indian father. There are controversies in Hemant's views about women. He has different view when they had Anu (daughter). Astha feels Hemant changed his views after Himanshu's birth. However, he believes that care of children, family, husband and in-laws are women's works and responsibilities. The roots of patriarchy are in his subconscious mind though he is educated in Western culture.

After he came home the last thing he wished to bother about was taking care of a child.

It's your job,' he said. (MW: 70)

'It's woman's work,' said Hemant firmly. Hire somebody to help you, or quit your job.' (MW: 70)

'And,' continued Hemant, 'my son is going to be very lucky for us.' (MW: 70)

Astha's mother willingly accepts that the property rights belong to man. She tries to convince her daughter to accept patriarchal traditional way of thinking about central man power and rights. She says to Astha,

'People do not live in their things, beti. Besides,' added the mother, 'it is Hemant's house, and he said there was no room.' (MW: 87)

Kapur explores that women try to support male centric society, believe on men's superior abilities and accept responsibilities. Astha's mother thinks that men know everything like, money, land, property, business, etc. She considers her son-in-law, Hemant more responsible than her daughter, Astha. Therefore, she hands over the money to Hemant instead of Astha. Astha is not ready to accept these things,

'They why give it to Hemant?' asked Astha bridling.

‘Why not? He is a man, he knows about money. He will invest it for you and the children. I have discussed the whole thing with him.’ (MW: 97)

Feminism has acquired some space in different fields of society i. e. education, law, culture, etc. Therefore, new generation women are came into contact with the new feministic approaches and became aware of their property rights of husband and father. Kapur shows through argument of Astha’s mother that she should not live with daughter. But Astha replies,

‘It is my house too. If people mind it is just too bad. I don’t believe in all this shit about parents being the responsibility only of the sons.’ (MW: 94)

‘Then who am I? The tenant?’ (MW: 87)

However, old generation Astha’s mother suggests her to accept and follow traditional ways and not runs away from house, domestic work, society and obligations. She tries to teach her to tackle them. ‘The meaning of life is struggle’ (MW: 88).

Therefore, these novels show that the powers like personal, familial, social, economic, political, etc. in Indian patriarchal society accumulate with men though Constitution of India ensure the equal rights to the women. Women of new generation are asking for their rights, but such types of examples are very few.

2.2 Property Rights

Constitution of India gives equal rights to women to have means of livelihood (Article 39a). However, in patriarchal families, women have no right to own property but they are property of men (Karve, 1972). The foundations of patriarchy are as specific to relationship between father and daughter and complexities between power and gender. Virmati, protagonist in DD by Manju Kapur is beautiful girl from jeweller’s family. Kasturi, Virmati’s mother says that Virmati need not jewellery but she is jewel, ‘She is a jewel, that is enough!’ (DD: 206).

Arundhati Roy presents negligence for daughters in property rights even though they worked equally to sons. Ammu and Chacko are sister and brother working together in their own factory, equally. However, Chacko, refers as ‘my factory, my pineapples, my pickles’ whenever he deals with food inspectors or sanitary engineers, etc. Legally, Ammu is daughter and Chacko is son but she has no claim to property (TGST: 57).

‘What’s yours is mine and what’s mine is also mine.’ Chacko said. (TGST: 57)

‘Thanks to our wonderful male chauvinist society,’

Ammu said. (TGST: 57)

Arundhati Roy presents the patriarchal control not only over women but also property. Here, Chacko said to his sister, Ammu to leave maternal home because it is property of men and not to women.

‘Get out of my house before I break every bone in your body!’ My house, my pineapples, my pickles. (TGST: 225)

Saroja in Deshpande’s MO returned to maternal home i. e. RK’s house after her husband’s death. Though, she talks and laughs loudly than the other women, bossing the servants and slapping children but the property rights goes to her brother.

‘This is my brother’s house, I have every right to order people about.’ (MO: 151)

Here, it is notable that she is sister of RK and heir of that family but she does not claim that house is her own and declared patriarchal rights and possession transferred to her brother. Brother has to look after and protect his sisters as being a responsible family member. Raja looks after his sisters i. e. Premi and Hemi (MO: 40). Further, patriarchy teaches the society that woman should go back to her in-laws and become as a good wife, a good *bahu* [daughter-in-law], a good *bhabhi* [brother’s wife], etc. (MO: 19). Manjari is watching all these things in TV serials.

Identity of heir by father and immovability of property rights in interracial, inter-caste and interethnic groups are fundamental identity of patriarchy. Father in the novel, MO says, if his son will marry with a girl from different caste, he will lose his family and property rights, forever. Badri’s grandfather in MO disinherited to his son for his decision of marriage with a girl from different caste. The mother’s consent is not taken into consideration for the decision of disinherit to their son.

‘he disowned his son ritually, he disinherited him legally.’ (MO: 6)

Similarly, Arun Joshi’s Mr. Khemka instructs his son, Babu not to marry with American girl, June Blyth instead of Marwari girl. Otherwise he will disinherit him legally (TF). Therefore, these novels explore husband, father and child especially son essence for woman.

Roy refers to mythical stories in Hindu literature i.e. *Mahabharata* shows exploitation of Draupadi in patriarchal society. Pandava put their wife, Draupadi in the game of dice as a property.

The man who had tried publicly to undress the Pandavas’ wife, Draupadi, after the Kauravas had won her in a game of dice. (TGST: 234)

Patriarchal families deny the equal rights to women in property of family on the ground of sex, heir, caste and religion. Even son also is losing his property rights when he marries with a girl from different caste or

religion. This is fully opposite to constitutional provision of equality before law (Article 14).

2.3 Husband's Control

Patriarchy gives husband all powers of holding i. e. wife, children, property including house, land, animal, money, etc. Husband makes regulations to operate wife. For instance, Mukherjee represents that husband not permits his wife to wear pants for a healthy society and mutual respect based on the clear distinction between the appearance and the functions of the sexes (W: 158-159). This control of husband over wife is reflects contradiction to the Constitution of India. The Constitution protects the rights regarding freedom of speech and expression, assembling, forming association, move freely, residing and settlement for women (Article 19).

In due course, women also not only agreed with the hold of husband over wife but support to perform the husband's power. In all respect, women follow the husband's rules, expectations, ego, etc. Tara says to Reena "It's not my fault. You're insulting my husband. You're insulting me." (TTD: 113). Tara felt that insult of her husband is her own. She follows ego of her husband. Religious literature inculcates husband's importance in woman's mind with deep sense through different idols. Mukherjee presents this process skillfully through dream of Dimple in her novel, 'Wife'.

She became Sita, the ideal wife of Hindu legends, who had walked through fire at her husband's request. Such pain, such loyalty, seemed reserved for married women. (W: 6)

Dimple follows her husband and feels happy in his control over her body and life. Mukherjee presents obedient and submissive female characters in this novel,

Are you forgetting the unforgettable Sita of legends? Can you not recall how she walked through fire to please Ram, her kingly husband? Did Sita humiliate him by refusing to stroll through fire in front of his subjects and friends? (W: 27)

Preferably, the society believes that women should stay at home and care for the family including husband, children and other family members. Amit in the novel, 'Wife' wants to stay his wife, Dimple at home. Amit distinguishes the discriminated role for husband and wife in the family, clearly. Husband should earn for family and wife should depend for her needs.

"One breadwinner in the family is quite enough," said Amit, looking to Dimple for agreement. (W: 61)

Desai portrays different aspects of women's dependency in her CTP. Maya brought up like princess at her father's home and married with affluent lawyer

who is her father's age. The situation promotes her to stay at home and be a caretaker. Markandaya's protagonist, Rukmani works in the field for survival of family whereas women in western culture presented by Joshi in his novel 'TF' are free to work outside for survival and satisfaction. June Blyth works as a Statistician at office and Sheila works with her father in their own company. It is remarkable that inner voice of freedom inculcated in western culture promotes Dimple to test the inferences of free living i. e. western dresses, drinks, etc. However, she has no courage to ask her husband for her expectations. She lives under the command of Amit. He preferred to order her serve him facilities as Indian wife instead of work outside for her satisfaction.

"What porch? What patio?" Amit asked and threw his balled-up dirty shirt on her lap. "Clean this." (W: 89)

Indian immigrants in America are in deep rift of cultural contradictions. Amit gives freedom to Dimple but not fully. He asks to Dimple to make friends and participate in their cultural activities like celebrations, parties, etc. However, he does not allow her to wear pants, which is a common phenomenon in American culture.

"You're becoming American, but not too American, I hope. I don't want you to be like Mrs. Mullick and wear pants in the house!" (W: 112)

However, she learns to manage Amit and follows her ambitions in his absence.

Amit never came back before six-thirty. She felt very safe. (W: 121)

In patriarchy base society, women also carry discriminating principles for women. Meena wants to marry her daughter with Bengali engineer instead of a president. She felt the post of president is poor thing than being a wife of engineer.

"But I don't want her to be president, poor thing. I want her to marry a nice Bengali engineer like her daddy," Meena Sen said. (W: 124)

The patriarchy and men's control over women have long history. Jaya realizes men's command over women passes through generations when her husband, Mohan calls repeatedly, Jaya...Jaya...Jaya.... She recalls her memories of another experience. Mohan inform Jaya,

My mother never raised her voice against my father, however badly he behaved to her. (TLS: 83)

Lajwanti in DD presses her husband Chander Prakash's feet (DD: 12). It shows not only women slave but men's control over women through generations. Jaya learnt to control her anger and other things too. She says,

'I had found out all the things I could and couldn't do, all the things that were womanly and unwomanly.' (TLS: 83)

She learnt sharp defined woman's role at Mohan's house when she visited first time (TLS: 83). He commands over Jaya many times (TLS: 75, 76). For instance, Mohan reacts to Jaya when she is talking about Mohan's hostiles with Rahul and love for his brother's daughter, Revati.

That's your writer's imagination running away with you.' (TLS: 79)

Don't for God's sake bring that habit of exaggerating into our life, keep it for your stories.' (TLS: 79)

At the beginning, Jaya thinks about the words like disaster, wrongdoing, retribution are irrelevant to their lives. However, Mohan changes her sophisticated picture about life with bitter truth. Jaya says that her husband gave her a gift of 'special disaster'. 'It came like a prize packet, neatly tied with coloured ribbons,' (TLS: 4). She loses everything and doesn't understand what to do with this gift.

Kapur presents the power of decision and selection is accumulated with men in all respects in her novel, DD. Harish, the professor is not taking into consideration to his first wife, Ganga in his decision about second marriage with Virmati. It is not mean that he gives value to second wife. He chooses red sari for Virmati for marriage ceremony. It indicates not only the powers of selections with men i. e. groom but not with women i. e. bride. She is an under control of her husband from marriage (DD: 202).

Harish marries with Virmati for companion and conscious about her physical appearance. He possesses her as property and regulates her appearance.

Her hair scattered easily, she knew, and now it was almost all out of her plait. Harish would not want her appear untidy. There were so many eyes watching her. (DD: 218)

Thus, husband in Indian society regulates and controls all aspects of woman's life as a wife. Traditions, rituals, religion and social setup support to these inequalities between wife and husband and makes solid base for exploitations of women. These social arrangements deny the right of equality to women as Indian citizen.

2.4 Essence of Father

Deshpande shows essence of father (MO: 179) and husband in woman's life especially for widowhood (MO: 48). Fatherless Brahmin girl has inauspicious *Mangal* in her horoscope which Manjari's grandfather married with her, second time. These fatherless daughters have problems even after marriage as shown in horoscopes (MO: 7). Husband said to his wife,

'You are wronging our son. He must know his father. We need to know our parents....' (MO: 19)

Father is role model for son and sentimental place for daughter. However, daughter is more conscious about presence of father in the family. Sachi is more curious about the absence of her father than Anand. Sachi asks her mother,

'You haven't even kept a picture of him!....which the dead father's picture hanging on the wall is the focus of the family's life. (MO: 48)

Manjari feels loneliness in her widowhood and cannot share her feelings of pleasure and sorrows with anyone (MO: 86). Further, Kapur depicts the father's essence for the children's career. Mrs. Trivedi's parents call her back to live with them in Bangladesh after her husband's death. Mrs. Trivedi decides to educate her children in *Shiksha Kendra* but her parents warned,

'This school will not equip Ajay and Pipeelika for the competitive world,' warned the grandparents. 'They need to get ahead. They have no father, they are starting out with a disadvantage.' (MW: 119)

Therefore, this patriarchal society is not ready to accept women as independent person without father.

2.5 Essence of Husband, Child and Son

In Indian society, adult woman is always in need of husband, child and masculine power. She believes that her life is meaningless without husband and children. Rukmani in NIS says,

'If I grieve, I said, 'it is not for you, but for myself, beloved, for how shall I endure to live without you, who are my love and my life?' (NIS: 191)

The woman faces number of problems who cannot bear a child. Not only men blame her that she is barren but also women as,

'There are others,' she replied. 'Neighbours, women.... and I a failure, a woman who cannot even bear a child.' (NIS: 52)

Markandaya's Ira, returned back to her parents' home for her barrenness. Ira's husband says to mother-in-law, Rukmani,

'Mother-in-law,' he said, 'I intend no discourtesy, but this is no ordinary visit. You gave me your daughter in marriage. I have brought her back to you. She is a barren woman.' (NIS: 52)

Manju Kapur and Shashi Deshpande present child essence for woman not only for survival but for her

status in the family and society. Medha and Bharat in MO are childless keep Malu with them (MO: 156). Especially, son is more essential for family heir, property rights and religious rituals (MO: 243). The preference has been given to son, Badri for all kinds of rituals performed after the death of his father but not daughter, Gayatri (MO: 13). Badri looks after and care his father in illness. It is expected in patriarchal families from the son as he is the heir of that family not from the daughter.

But I do know that I can't expect anything from her –not because she is a daughter, but because I failed her in her time of need. (MO: 55)

Further, Deshpande presents the son is common heir for family like brother's son, in the case of couple is childless. Childless RK and Gayatri looks their heir in brother's son, Raja as son of the family.

...though RK was fond of Raja; to him, Raja was the son he didn't have, he was the heir of the family. (MO: 91)

Deshpande shows inner urge of men for son even they are satisfied with their daughters. Baba realizes this when he was with her grandson, Anand as,

I understood for the first time why men want sons. I had been happy, more than happy with my daughters, but this was different. It was like seeing my own past, like seeing the possibility of a different future, it was like being given another chance. (MO: 243)

She shows essence of son for property rights of the family in her another novel, CD (CD: 211). Manju Kapur also presents essence of son and presence for women's support and survival in her MW. Pipeelika thinks about her brother, Ajay settled in US like,

'What's the use of having a son and brother if all he does is write patronizing letters from the States?'(MW: 123)

Patriarchy based society not only prefer the son but also quest for boy child and deny the birth of daughter even in this modern society. Markandaya, Desai, Singh, Joshi and Mukherjee are enthusiastically depict the different views, approaches and situations to show essence of son in their novels. Male as well as female characters of these novels are preferred son than the daughter. They quest for son through traditional religious, superstitious ways as well as modern medicinal techniques. Sometimes this demand reaches to extreme and exploits woman like, deserted woman.

Amit demands son from his wife, Dimple in the novel, 'Wife' of Mukherjee. The driving power of the society i. e. property and earnings is in the hands of

men. Therefore, Amit expects that his expected son will become a doctor and make a lot of money. He said,

"It'll be a boy," Amit said.

"He'll be a doctor and mint money."
(W: 34)

The family members looked at the unborn son as a money maker, property and heir of family. Therefore, they are more conscious and solicitous about health of daughter-in-law, Dimple in her pregnancy.

They laid down rules: do not carry heavy pails of water to the bathroom or kitchen; do not trip on dark staircases.
(W: 34)

Similarly, Ira's husband in NIS wants sons to continue his line, carry his duties and dowry. He said,

'I have waited five years,' he replied.
'She has not borne in her first blooming, who can say she will conceive later? I need sons.' (NIS: 52)

Nathan enjoyed the birth of son as Rukmani's father (NIS: 22). 'He invited everybody from village to feast and rejoice with us in our good future' (NIS: 23). He also supports his son-in-law for his want of son and to take another woman for son (NIS: 63).

'I do not blame him,' Nathan said. 'He is justified, for a man needs children. He has been patient.' (NIS: 52)

Therefore, they are treated women as reproductive machine of sons but not human being like men. Nathan believes that daughter is the burden over family for dowry and leaves nothing but a memory behind (NIS: 17).

Essence of son not only flourished in men's mind but also acquires space of deep sense in women's mind. Desai's Pom is performing rituals in 'Birla Mandir' with offering flowers every Thursday for the son.

'I'm to have a baby - in November. I take flowers to the temple every Thursday - I want it to be a boy.' (CTP: 56)

Rukmani and her mother in NIS go to the temple and pray for bear son. Her mother gave a small stone lingam, symbol of fertility,

'Wear it,' she said. 'You will yet bear many sons. I see them, and what the dying see will come to pass.... be assured, this is no illusion.' (NIS: 20)

Rukmani's mother follows the traditional way for the son to Rukmani while Rukmani adopts the modern medicinal technique for her daughter, Ira to bear son. She goes to the doctor for Ira's barrenness and not to the temple. However, Rukmani is in tears when she gave birth to a girl child, Irawaddy.

Rukmani has tears of weakness and disappointment; for what woman wants a girl for her first-born? (NIS: 16)

One of the lady friends asked to Mrs. Lal in CTP about son, curiously. 'You have other children? Sons?' (CTP: 63). She replied, 'No. Four daughters.' (CTP: 63). It interprets the essence of son rather than daughters. 'Four daughters' indicate the burden over the family. Son is considered as a source of help to the family members. Similarly, the anonymous people ask to Rukmani about her son for help.

'Have you no sons to help?' (NIS: 189)

Shashi Deshpande shows the essence of son in life of women in her novel, TLS. Kusum has three daughters and expects the fourth be a son. Being a mother of daughters, Kusum is not useful for her family as well as anyone. Nobody consider her motherly feelings and need to her daughters. She feels nervous and blank future promotes her to suicide. However, Jaya looks after Kusum in her illness (TLS: 20).

Deshpande's another female character, Nayana also more conscious about son. She has two daughters and two sons are died soon after birth. Nayana whispers to Jaya 'that this time I will give birth to a boy child' (TLS: 27). However, she is exploited and always feels unsafe. She whispers when males are around her because she feels they would listen to her voice. Nayana is not expecting the dark future of girl child like herself. Her mother provides her all kinds of luxurious and loves but she is facing curse of being a mother of girls by men - her husband, brothers and father. Her husband is as wasters, good for nothing and drunkard (TLS: 28).

Normally, husband in patriarchal family demands son from wife otherwise he will punish her. Nayana's husband says her that he will throw her if she gives birth to another daughter and he will take another woman for son (TLS: 28). Similar example is depicted by Kamala Markandaya in her novel, NIS.

Patriarchal concepts, approaches and views also adopted by women willingly or unwillingly, especially, about son. Kishori Devi in DD is talking with son, Harish as,

'Don't worry. First pregnancies are like this. And with boys it is even more difficult.'

'How do you know it is a boy?' (DD: 244)

Kishori Devi thinks that Virmati will give birth to a son. She develops her guess using some signs, face and movements, the shape of her belly, the things she craves (DD: 244). It indicates women's conscious about the son. They care more Virmati for this cause and Harish not allows her out of house in pregnancy (DD: 274).

The youngest son of Ramukaka and Shantakaki always wants her mother. She tries to keep him away as possible. But her mother-in-law and other women whispers like 'She is ashamed of him, her own child,' (TLS: 29). Here, it shows that not only men established command over women but also women support to men for patriarchy (TLS: 29).

The essence of son ultimately inculcates and promotes the urge for son in married couples and society at large. Therefore, they perform many religious rituals before and after marriage, give birth to number of girls in waiting of son and man married with more women and harass them.

In modern society, parents are educated and trying to establish gender equality up to some extent. Hemant in Manju Kapur's MW has no difference between boy and girl child even though his in-laws expect boy child from his wife. He says to his mother-in-law,

'But Ma, I want a daughter,' (MW: 57)

In America there is no difference between boys and girls. (MW: 57)

However, his reported equality is not extended up to the next child which they have girl child at first. Hemant wants son from Astha for his paternal heir as he is only son of his parents. If the second time they will not have a son, they will try third time, fourth, fifth.....for son,

'I want to have my son soon,' declared Hemant, looking emotional and manly at the same time. 'I want to be as much a part of his life as Papaji is of mine.'

'How do you know we will have a son?' asked Astha, feeling a little scared.

'Of course we will have a son, and if we don't we needn't stop at two.' (MW: 61)

Women are also not behind for the support of patriarchal demand of son. Kapur not only explores the women's support but maternal demand of son from their daughters for well-being in their in-laws. Astha's mother wants boy from her daughter. She says to Hemant,

'Beta, you are right. May it be a boy, and carry your name for ever. A great son of a great father.' (MW: 57)

Astha's mother believes in God, *Swamiji* and religious and traditional ways,

'God willing it will be a boy,' said her mother. 'I have asked swamiji's advice as to what offerings to make.' (MW: 67)

Kapur depicts the consciousness of society about the baby's gender i. e. everybody, colleagues, in-laws, friends' wives, mothers, the cook, the gardener and all

(MW: 68). Therefore, the birth of son is the point of great celebrations especially if he is the first male in the family (CD: 101). All aspects of women's life deal with birth of boy child. Birth of girl child is not accepted equally as boy even though Constitution of India ensures the equality for both.

2.6 Sake of Husband

Gandhari in *Mahabharata* is a famous idol of 'wife sacrifice' for husband. She becomes artificially blind for the sake of husband's blindness. Jaya compares herself with Gandhari as an ideal wife (TLS: 61, 62). She says to Mohan,

'I've sacrificed my life for you and the children.' (TLS: 120)

Here, Mohan insists Jaya to buy couple of good saris to herself not to maintain her status but to satisfy his ego (TLS: 61). Similarly, professor, Harish in DD of Manju Kapur wants to teach her illiterate wife. He felt shame about her illiteracy at his status as professor. This is not acceptable for man (DD: 40). Here, one thing is remarkable that Kishori Devi, mother of Harish says,

'Beta, you are very good. How many husbands encourage their wives to study after their marriages? She has got a diamond-a diamond from heaven! (DD: 260)

Jeeja scolds her daughter-in-law, Tara for do not blame her son because he keeps the *kumkum* on your forehead. 'What is woman without that?' (TLS: 53). Jeeja's step son, Rajaram is a drunkard and tortures them. Jeeja tries to protect her son, Rajaram in quarrel with Tara (TLS: 53). Jeeja says children would be fatherless and Tara's *kumkum* smashed, if Rajaram will die. Jeeja's further claim gives information about victimized women's conscious. She felt Tara will be foolish by the people (TLS: 160).

Traditionally, men have choice not only about life but also sex and it is undercurrent that women should accept it willingly. Vanitamami advices Jaya before her marriage like,

'If your husband has a mistress or two, ignore it; take up a hobby instead-cats, maybe, or your sister's children'. (TLS: 31)

Manju Kapur portrays the competition between co-wives, Ganga and Virmati to maintain their husband, Professor Harish. Ganga is elder typical wife routinely works for him i. e. washing his clothes, etc. Virmati feels uncomfortable for not to serve her husband, Harish. She is jealous about Ganga as co-wife and wants to do everything for Harish before her. Harish keeps illiterate Ganga for look after the home but feels unsuitable companion. Therefore, he says to Virmati,

'You are my other self. Let her wash my cloths, if she feels like it. It has

nothing to do with me. I don't want a washerwoman. I want a companion.' (DD: 217)

Thus, wife is fully depends on husband for livelihood and she has to do all things for the sake of husband.

2.7 Hands of Gold

The husband as well as in-laws expects beautiful bride with expertise in housekeeping including cooking, washing, cleaning, etc. and hands of crafting including needlework, embroidery, paintings, etc. for decorations. Sometimes women have special qualities like education, writings along with source of earnings are proud of their husbands and in-laws. Feminist writers call to these women as 'Hands of Gold'. Deshpande's Mohan is proud of his writer wife, Jaya. He often introduces her as 'My wife is a writer' (TLS: 119). However, Jaya wrote the story about middle class family and their relations, realistically. Mohan felt that Jaya should not criticize men like him in her writing which may society take him into consideration as the man in the story. The things are not kept up to only this kind of criticism and replies but the seventeen years marriage is broken. Therefore, husband and in-laws expect that the wife or daughter-in-law with hands of gold but she should not criticize them. Mohan wants to write Jaya humorous pieces about the travails of a middle class housewife. 'Nothing serious.....oh no, nothing serious' (TLS: 148, 149).

2.8 Control over Women

The purity of race and caste is always gone through control over women and their reproductive capacity. Deshpande explores men's control over women as father, husband, brother and son in patriarchal society. They use women for their purpose,

Mangal, even as a young woman, made herself into a mother figure, a facade that Laxman used for his own purposes, the way he used his own mother, ... (MO: 171)

Deshpande depicts men's control over women and their body even in extramarital relations. Rani in CD has extramarital relations with Mahesh. He expects that Rani should act with his direction. However, Rani should not give up her career along with Mahesh. Rani is ready to leave Mahesh for her career which then he became abusive and violent (CD: 214). Deshpande explores similar eternal conflicts between man and woman in her another novel, MO. The man asserts his rights and claims woman's body (MO: 276). Further, Kapur also presents men's control over women, their body and mind also,

He sat on the sofa, and Astha knelt to take off his shoes. She unlaced them, and pulled off his socks, gathering the day's dust in her lap. (MW: 48)

Chetan Bhagat explores the 21st century issues like education, corruption, politics, national freedom, hypocrisy, love, multi-culture, liberalization, etc. However, the girl, Vidya is not allowed to attend tuitions outside the home. Her father not permits her to go outside but tutor should come at home (TMML: 38). Brother, Ishaan performs his responsibilities to his sister, Vidya. He beats the boy who harassed her. Brother as protector of sister shows the control over women (TMML: 4). Further, Govind expresses his views about Vidya as a Indian girl,

I'd have killed her if she walked around in a bikini. Wait a minute, I'd kill her or her brother Ish would kill her? Why should I care? But I did say I would kill her? (TMML: 166)

Bhagat crucially elaborates the control of brother, friend and life partner over Indian women. Thus, all these novelists present the patriarchal control over women even they are educated and modern. However, Manju Kapur and Deshpande show women's rebel against this control up to certain limit.

3 RESULTS AND FINDINGS

Father in patriarchal family holds the rights of property and keeps control over women. The mind setup of Indian women remains supportive to men for this social setup and behaviour. Therefore, this study deals with patriarchy as symbolic power, property rights, essence of father, essence of husband, urge for son, women's activities for the sake of husband, etc. Recently, women came out of home at workplaces but as 'hands of gold', not as independent person. Similar understanding about culture is also inculcated within men. India resolved own Constitution for justice, liberty, equality and fraternity on 26th November 1949 and implemented on 26th January 1950. Therefore, fifteen Indian English novels after independence written by men and women novelists analyzed with feminist approach to understand the appearance of patriarchy in Indian contemporary society.

1. The foundations of patriarchy are as specific to relationship between father and daughter and complexities between power and gender.
2. Men are leading the family and oppressive power in the society and women are at secondary and inferior place.
3. Mukherjee presents obedient and submissive female characters in her novels. She distinguishes the discriminated role of husband and wife in family, clearly as husband should earn for family and wife should depend for her needs.
4. In patriarchal families women have no right to own property but they are property of men. Arundhati Roy and Deshpande present negligence for girls in property rights even though they worked equally to sons.
5. Roy refers mythical stories in Hindu literature i. e. *Mahabharata* shows exploitation of Draupadi in patriarchal society. Pandava put their wife, Draupadi in the game of dice as a property.
6. Men always try to get credit of success to own even women contribute their efforts.
7. Kapur, Deshpande and Bhagat present women's belief and support to male centric society in their novels.
8. Deshpande and Bhagat show the need of men's protection to women from early childhood.
9. Identity of heir by father and immovability property rights in interracial, inter caste and interethnic groups are fundamental identity of patriarchy.
10. Old generation Astha's mother suggests Astha to accept and follow traditional ways and not runs away from house, domestic work, society and obligations.
11. Husband makes rules for wife to maintain healthy society and mutual respect based on the clear distinction between the appearance and the functions of the sexes.
12. In all respect, women follow the husband's rules, expectations, ego, etc. Religious literature inculcates husband's importance in woman's mind with deep sense through different idols.
13. New generation women are came into contact with the new feministic approaches and became aware of their property rights of husband and father.
14. Markandaya's protagonist, Rukmani works in the field for survival of family.
15. Joshi's western woman, June Blyth is free to work outside for survival and satisfaction.
16. Indian woman is living in western culture promotes to test the inferences of free living i. e. western dresses, drinks, etc. instead of courage to ask her husband for her expectations.
17. Kapur presents the power of decision and selection is accumulated with men in all respect in her novel. She explored long history of patriarchy and men's control over women passes through generations.
18. Kapur's Lajwanti shows woman slave through pressing the feet of her husband, Chander Prakash.
19. Kapur and Deshpande show essence of father and husband in woman's life especially for widowhood and children's career, respectively.
20. Indian adult woman is always in need of husband, child and masculine power. Manju Kapur and Shashi Deshpande present child essence for woman not only for survival but her status in the family and society. Especially, son is essential for family heir, property rights and religious rituals.

21. Deshpande presents the son is common heir for family like brother's son, in the case of couple is childless. She presents inner urge of men for son even they are satisfied with their daughters.
22. Men and women quest for son through traditional religious, superstitious ways as well as modern medicinal techniques. Sometimes this demand reaches to extreme and exploits woman like, deserted woman.
23. The family members look at the unborn son as a money maker, property and heir of the family. Therefore, they are more conscious and solicitous about health of daughter-in-law.
24. In NIS, Markandaya shows that daughter is the burden over family for dowry.
25. Deshpande presents husband demanding son from wife otherwise he will punish, throw her and take another woman for son.
26. Markandaya shows the use of modern medicinal technique to bear a child in her novel.
27. Women in patriarchal families adopt their concepts, approaches and views also willingly or unwillingly about son.
28. Modern families accept the birth of girl child at first time but not next. Women support maternal demand of son from their daughters for well-being in their in-laws.
29. Traditionally, men have choice not only about life but also sex and it is undercurrent that women should accept it willingly.
30. The husband as well as in-laws expect beautiful bride with expertise in housekeeping including cooking, washing, cleaning, etc. and hands of crafting including needlework, embroidery, paintings, etc. for decorations.
31. Women have special qualities like education, writings along with source of earnings are proud of their husbands and in-laws. Feminist writers call to these women as 'Hands of Gold'.
32. Deshpande explores the purity of race and caste is always gone through control over women and their reproductive capacity.
33. Chetan Bhagat explores the 21st century issues like education, corruption, politics, national freedom, hypocrisy, love, multi-culture, liberalization, etc. However, the girl in his novel not free to attend the activities outside the home. He crucially elaborates the control of brother, friend and life partner over Indian women.
34. Thus, all these novelists present the patriarchal control over women even they are educated and modern.
35. Kapur and Deshpande show women's rebel against this control up to certain limit.

Characters, setting or situations, dialogues, point of view, etc. in these selected novels show unequal, secondary and exploited status of women in Indian society. Therefore, justice, liberty, equality and fraternity given in Constitution of India are yet to be achieved for women. Women are accepting their status willingly or unwillingly. Only few characters are rebellious for their constitutional rights. The findings and analysis of the study are useful to understand the status of women in Indian society and planning and management to achieve constitutional provisions for social welfare.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Author is thankful to anonymous reviewers for constructive comments and suggestions to enrich the manuscript for descriptions, findings and applicability.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

Author confirms no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

- Bhagat, C., 2008. *The 3 Mistakes of My Life*. Rupa Publications India, New Delhi.
- Bhagat, C., 2011. *Revolution 2020*. Rupa Publications India, New Delhi.
- Campbell, R. and Wasco, S., 2000. Feminist approaches to social science: Epistemological and methodological tenets. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 28, 773-791. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005159716099>
- Constitution of India.
- Cosgrove, L. and McHugh, M. C., 2000. Speaking for ourselves: Feminist methods and community psychology. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 28(6), 815-838. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005163817007>
- Dar, A. M., 2013. Postmodernism in Amitav Ghosh's novels. *Language in India*, 13(7), 178-187.
- Deal, W. E. and Beal, T. K., 2004. *Theory for religious studies*. New York, London: Routledge.
- Desai, A., 1963. *Cry, the Peacock*, Orient Paperbacks, Ed. 2014.
- Deshpande, S., 1988. *That Long Silence*, Penguin Books India, Indian Ed. 1989.
- Deshpande, S., 2004. *Moving On*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 2008.
- Deshpande, S., 2008. *In the Country of Deceit*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 2009.
- Foord, J. and Gregson, N., 1986. Patriarchy: Towards a reconceptualization. *Antipode*, 18(2), 186-211. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8330.1986.tb00362.x>
- Ghosh, A., 1988. *The Shadow Lines*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 2009.
- Ghosh, S., 2007. *Feminism in India*, Maitrayee Chaudhuri (Ed.), Zed Books, 33-39.
- Hans, A., 2013. Feminism as a literary movement in India. *International Research Journal of Applied and Basic Sciences*, 4(7), 1762-1767.
- Hawkesworth, M., 2004. The semiotics of Premature Burial: Feminism in a post-feminist age source. *Journal of*

- Women in Culture and Society*, 29(4), 961-985. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1086/383492>
- Hemmings, C., 2007. What is a feminist theorist responsible for? Response to Rachel Torr. *Feminist Theory*, 8(1), 69-76. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464700106069042>
- Joshi, A., 1968. *The Foreigner*, Orient Paperbacks, Ed. 1993.
- Kapur, M., 1998. *Difficult Daughters*, Faber and Faber Limited, London.
- Kapur, M., 2002. *A Married Woman*, IndiaInk, New Delhi.
- Karve, I., 1972. *Sanskriti*. Deshmukh and Company, Pune, Ed. 1972 (1st), 2006 (2nd), 88.
- Markandaya, K., 1954. *Nectar in a Sieve*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 2009.
- Matustik, M. B., 2002. Existential social theory after the poststructuralist and communication turns. *Human Studies*, 25(2), 147-164. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1015500509943>
- Moghadam, V. M., 1992. Development and women's emancipation: Is there a connection? *Development and Change*, 23(3), 215-255. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-7660.1992.tb00463.x>
- Mukherjee, B., 1971. *The Tiger's Daughter*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 1987.
- Mukherjee, B., 1975. *Wife*, Fawcett Book, New York.
- Nehere, K., 2017. The feminist views: A review. *Feminist Research*, 1(1), 3-20. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21523/gcj2.16010101>
- Prasad, S., 2011. The social vision in the novels of George Orwell. *Anusandhanika*, 9(1), 126-130.
- Roy, A., 1997. *The God of Small Things*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 2002.
- Sen, S., 1998. *Communist manifesto and theory of revolution*, National Book Agency, Calcutta, 1-3.
- Singh, K., 1956. *Train to Pakistan*, Penguin Books India, Ed. 2009.
- Turksma, R., 2001. Feminist classic philosophers and the other women. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 36(17), 1413-1424.
- Weiner, G., 2004. Critical action research and third wave feminism: A meeting of paradigms. *Educational Action Research, Theoretical Resource*, 12(4), 631-643.
- Witt, C., 2004a. Feminist history of philosophy. *Feminist reflections on the history of philosophy*, Ed. Alanen, L. and Witt, C., 55, 1-16.
- Witt, C., 2004b. Form normativity and gender in Aristotle: A feminist perspective. *Feminist reflections on the history of philosophy*, Ed. Alanen, L. and Witt, C., 55, 117-136.
- Zalewski, M. and Runyan, A. S., 2013. Taking feminist violence seriously in feminist international relations. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 15(3), 293-313. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2013.766102>
- Zinn, M. B., 2000. Feminism and family studies for a new century. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 571, 42-56.
